

EASTERN AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE

Date of Meeting	15 th March 2012
Application Number	E/2011/0895/FUL
Site Address	Southcott Manor, Pewsey, Wiltshire SN9 5JF
Proposal	Part demolition of existing building, alterations and construction of new extensions. Demolition of garage and erection of garden wall.
Applicant	Mr & Mrs R Middleton
Town/Parish Council	PEWSEY
Grid Ref	416990 159387
Type of application	Full Planning
Case Officer	April Waterman

Reason for the application being considered by Committee

This application, and its sister application for Listed Building Consent, have been called to committee by the Division Member, Cllr Kunkler.

1. Purpose of Report

To consider the recommendation to refuse the application for planning permission.

2. Report Summary

Permission is sought for the partial demolition, reconfiguration and extension of this Grade II Listed Building, the demolition of a double garage, and the construction of a new 2.2m high wall to separate the garden of Southcott Cottage from the driveway to the north of the principal house.

The proposed works to the house are considered not to be acceptable in terms of the degree of loss of historic fabric and of the scale and design of the extensions.

The demolition of the double garage and the erection of garden wall are considered to be acceptable.

3. Site Description

Southcott Manor is located in the open countryside about 1km to the south east of the centre of Pewsey, served off Green Drove, and bounded to the east by Southcott Road. The site lies within the North Wessex Downs Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, on relatively flat land in the Pewsey Vale floor.

Other residential and agricultural development is grouped loosely along these roads.

The property comprises the principal Grade II Listed house, together with a collection of buildings

including an enlarged cottage, a timber framed thatched former threshing barn and further domestic and agricultural outbuildings. Land associated with the manor is used for garden and orchard/agricultural purposes.

The house is orientated with its main rooms presenting to the south, overlooking gardens. The driveway serving the property brings vehicles to the garage and parking areas to the immediate north west and north of the house, and the most used entry into the house is now on the north side, rather than through the main porch on the south face of the building.

The house as it now stands comprises a central (original early 19th century) block, almost square in form, with a ground floor modern wing to the east, and a narrow two storey service wing to the west. The different scales, forms, designs and detailing of the two existing wings are clearly identifiable from the original central four-room-plan house, especially from the south, where the integrity of the main house block is best appreciated.

The current west wing incorporates elements of earlier structures (a dairy) and although it has undergone much change, evidence of each stage of its evolution (and therefore the history of the overall building) is retained in the existing structure.

4. Planning History

K/45176/L	Replacement of existing conservatory with new larger one
K/45177	Replacement of existing conservatory with new larger one.
K/13069	Single storey extension, housing, swimming pool and amenities.
K/86/0409	Alterations and extension
K/86/1239	New conservatory and extensions to stable block
E/11/0408/LBC	Erection of orangery
E/2011/0896/LBC	Part demolition of existing building including double garage and new extensions and alterations.

Pre-application advice relating to the extension of the building was provided to the applicants by the Conservation Officer in March 2011. The advice included the following:

“ it would appear that successfully extending the house without impacting on the special interest of the building may be difficult to achieve, due to the fact that the building has been extended in the past. Notwithstanding the desirability of additional accommodation, any proposals to alter or extend a listed building must be fully justified (in terms of their impact on the listed building, its fabric and setting) and I am therefore unable to see what convincing justification could be given for further extension to the property.”

5. The Proposal

The scheme for development has been amended since its first submission, although it still comprises three elements: the partial demolition, reconfiguration and extension of the main house, the demolition of a double garage, and the construction of a new 2.2m high garden wall.

The existing accommodation comprises a kitchen, lounge, dining room, drawing room, two utility rooms, front and rear halls retaining the through passage route, main and back stairs, conservatory, sauna, changing room, two downstairs W.C.s and enclosed swimming pool. The first floor of the main house has been altered from its original four bedroom and landing layout to

show three bedrooms and two bathrooms, with a fourth bedroom and third bathroom in the connected first floor section of the west wing.

The application initially sought permission to provide a six bedroomed house by the following alterations and extensions:

- the removal of the upper floor area of the main house above part of the rear hall and existing drawing room to show a galleried dining space, including a new main curved staircase;
- the blocking of the through passage hallway and the insertion of a cloakroom with W.C.;
- the provision of three bedrooms and one bathroom within the remaining first floor of the original house;
- replacement of the single storey east wing (except for a section of the north wall) to form a two storey block with games room and kitchenette (with retention of the swimming pool building beyond), and two new bedrooms, four bathrooms and a laundry on its first floor;
- demolition of the west wing (again, with the exception of parts of its north and west walls) and replacement with a two storey and further single storey extension to provide a kitchen/breakfast/family room, a sub-kitchen, a pantry, a utility room, a boot room and a W.C. on the ground floor, with a master bedroom, dressing room and en-suite bathroom above.

Amendments to the scheme comprise:

The application now shows:

- the retention/re-instatement of the four-room plan on both ground and first floors of the original house, accommodating a dining room, drawing room, study and snug on the ground floor, with three bedrooms, a bathroom, and the dressing room to serve the master suite;
- a two storey (largely replacement) extension on the west side to provide a master bedroom and its bathroom;
- a two storey (largely) replacement extension on the east side to provide two further bedrooms and two bathrooms (i.e. six bedrooms in all);
- the setting back of the proposed ground and first floor east wing by 2.3 metres from the south facade of the original house;
- the setting back of the ground floor of the west wing extension by 0.8 metres from the south facade of the original house, with the first floor element being set back by 2.3 metres.

In essence, the revised proposals differ from the initial submission by a reworking of proposals in the central house and a slight reduction in the overall size of the extensions. This has resulted in the omission of the new curved and galleried staircase, two upstairs bathrooms, a sub-kitchen and a kitchenette. The depth of the wings has been reduced, with a slight shortening of the length of the east wing only.

The degree of demolition of the existing west side structures has not changed.

6. Planning Legislation and Policy

Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990

National Policy Guidance

PPS1 Delivering sustainable development

PPS5 Planning for the historic environment

PPS7 Sustainable development in rural areas

Wiltshire and Swindon Structure Plan 2016

Policy HE7 Conservation areas and listed buildings
Policy C8 Areas of Outstanding Natural Beauty

Kennet Local Plan 2011
Policy PD1 Development and design
Policy NR6 Sustainability and protection of the countryside
Policy NR7 Protection of the landscape

7. Consultations

Wiltshire Council Conservation Officer

Initial proposals: Summary - The demolition, extensions and the extent of internal alterations proposed for this listed building are unacceptable as they are deemed to result in substantial harm to the designated heritage asset and its setting, which is contrary to PPS5 policy HE9.

Amended plans: Objection sustained, as the scheme has not addressed all the reasons for objection previously raised (in particular the degree of demolition, and the scale of extensions).

[Note – English Heritage comments on the LBC application are relevant also to the determination of the planning application, although English Heritage is a formal consultee only for the LBC application.]

Parish Council – Support.

8. Publicity

The application was advertised by site notice and by notice in the local press. No public comments have been received.

9. Planning Considerations

Impact on Heritage Asset

Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 places a duty on the Local Planning Authority to have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses, when determining an application for planning permission.

The assessment of the impact of the proposed works to the house on the heritage asset is set out fully in the preceding report for the application for Listed Building Consent E/12011/0896/LBC. In summary, the proposed works are considered to comprise inappropriate development, which would not safeguard the architectural and historic heritage of the area. The development would not preserve the building, its setting, nor particular features of special architectural or historic interest, so would not accord with the expectations of satisfy the requirements of relevant legislation but instead would conflict with national government policy contained in PPS 5 and with the terms and objectives of policy HE7 of the Wiltshire and Swindon Structure Plan 2016.

The existing garage has not been identified as having any significant intrinsic or group heritage value, although by dint of it being a curtilage structure, and its age (probably having been constructed prior to 1948) it falls in the protection of the Listing of the main house. The contribution that it makes to the setting of the principal house is considered to be neutral. Its demolition would be acceptable, subject to appropriate works of making good to the ground being defined, approved and carried out. The proposals also include the erection of a 2.2 m high brick wall, which (also

subject to details being submitted and approved of its design, bond and material) would be acceptable in terms of its impact on the setting of the Listed Building.

Impact on AONB

The impact of the development on the character and appearance of the North Wessex Downs Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty would, in general, have no damaging effect on the designation, and would not conflict with the terms of Policy C8 of the Wiltshire and Swindon Structure Plan 2016 nor the protective landscape policies (NR6 and NR7) of the Kennet Local Plan 2011. The scale of the development in relation to the total grouping of buildings at Southcott within the landscape, and the significance of the enlargement of the principal building *in this overall context* would not harm the character and special landscape quality of this part of the Wiltshire countryside.

Impact on neighbouring residents / land uses

The scheme would have no detrimental impact on the amenity of other residential property in the area, nor would it adversely affect agricultural activity in the area.

Highway Issues

No highway issues are raised by the proposed works.

Impact on Trees / Biodiversity

While some crown-trimming of a number of trees close to the proposed eastern first floor extension may be needed, no significant harm to the biodiversity value of the site would result from the proposed development.

Summary: The scheme would accord with the criteria of policy PD1 of the Kennet Local Plan 2011, therefore, except for the fundamental issue of the damage that the scheme would cause to the heritage asset (i.e. B7 of the policy PD1 criteria, namely relationship with historic features).

10. Conclusion

The proposed demolition of the garage, and the erection of a garden wall are acceptable, but the proposed extensions to the Grade II Listed house are not acceptable. It is not possible to issue a split decision on applications for planning permission, therefore refusal of permission for the scheme in its entirety is recommended.

RECOMMENDATION

That planning permission be REFUSED for the following reason:

As a result of the extent of demolition of historic fabric, and of the scale and design of the extensions and alterations that are intended, the proposed works are considered to comprise inappropriate development, which would not safeguard the architectural and historic heritage of the area. The development would not preserve the building, nor particular features of special architectural or historic interest, so would not accord with the expectations of, nor satisfy the requirements of relevant legislation but instead would conflict with national government advice contained in PPS 5 and with the terms and objectives of policy PD1 of the Kennet Local Plan 2011 and policy HE7 of the Wiltshire and Swindon Structure Plan 2016.

Appendices:

None

Background Documents Used in the Preparation of this Report:

Application files, PPS 5 and its accompanying Practice Guide, Wiltshire and Swindon Structure Plan 2016, Kennet Local Plan 2011.